

UDS A06

Claims 1, 22, 2, 3, 14-18, 23-27, 28 and 42 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over Lever, et al.

Applicants point out that claims 1, 22, 30 and 42 have been amended to add that the coating may comprise reaction products of amino propyl triethoxy silane. Applicants noted, when the Examiner cited trihydroxy silane against the claim, that the material used, namely the amino propyl triethoxy silane, forms as a first reaction product, the hydroxy material and other subsequent reaction products. This is inherent in a coating of this material. The claims have been broadened to include these materials.

In view of the amendments made, applicants submit that the claims are patentable over the prior art. reconsideration and allowance of the claims is respectfully requested.

The Examiner indicates that the use of a portion of the claimed compounds with other backbones makes the presently claimed compounds obvious. However, Applicants submit that the materials that were claimed and described are the results of substantial experimentation. For the use described both the portion or the claimed compounds found in the prior art and the portion of the claimed compounds that are found (in combination) only in the claims, contribute to the final positive properties of the coatings. Applicants submit that these coatings must meet a number of requirements, such as toner transfer and quality, as well as good adhesion. The Examiner has proffered no *prima facie* evidence that any trihydroxy silane and any amine terminated material will act equally well. Absent such evidence, the prior art could provide only "obvious to try" for the presently claimed material, which are just two materials among very many materials that one might try. It is well established that "obvious to try is not enough to establish a *prima facie* case of obviousness.

In re O'Farrell, 859 F.2d 1673 (Fed. Cir. 1988), the Board stated: 'The Dean statement is of the type that gives only general guidance and is not at all specific as to the particular form of the claimed invention and how to achieve it. Such a suggestion may make an approach "obvious to try" but it does not make the invention obvious.' [see MPEP §2145, X(b)]

Applicants submit that the present application is now ready for allowance. If the Examiner does not agree, the Examiner is respectfully requested to call the undersigned at toll free 1 (877) 428-5468. This number connects directly to the undersigned's office in Israel. Note that Israel is 7 hours ahead of Washington, and that the normal work week is Sunday through Thursday. The undersigned can usually be reached until 11:30 AM Washington time at the above number.

UDS A06

A marked-up version of the amendment is attached hereto..

Respectfully submitted,
Y. ALMOG, et al.


Paul FENSTER
Reg. No. 33,877

January 1, 2003
William H. Dippert, Esq.
Reed Smith LLP
599 Lexington Avenue, 29th Floor
New York, NY 10022-7650

UDS A06

MARKED-UP AMENDED CLAIMS

1 (Amended) A substrate suitable for printing an image thereon, comprising:

a sheet of plastic;

an underlayer coating, on the sheet of plastic, comprising a first polymer material comprising a polymer chosen from the group consisting of amine terminated polyamide, [a silane coupling agent and] amino propyl triethoxy silane and reaction products of amino propyl triethoxy silane; and

an overlay coating, directly on the underlayer, comprising a second polymer material and having an outer surface to which toner can be fused and fixed.

10. (Four Times Amended) A substrate according to claim 1 or claim 42 wherein the sheet of plastic is polyethylene terephthalate (PET).

22. (Four Times Amended) A substrate according to claim 1 or claim 42 wherein the underlayer comprises amino propyl triethoxy silane or reaction products of amino propyl triethoxy silane.

28. (Four Times Amended) A substrate according to claim 1 or claim 42 wherein the underlayer is [substantially] free of particulate matter.

30. (Amended) A method of producing a coated substrate which a toner image can be adhered comprising:

coating a sheet of plastic with a first polymer material as an underlayer, the underlayer comprising a polymer material chosen from the group consisting of amine terminated polyamide, [a silane coupling agent and] amino propyl triethoxy silane and reaction products of amino propyl triethoxy silane;

directly overcoating the underlayer with an second polymer material to form an overlayer coating on the underlayer, the overlayer having an outer surface to which a toner image can be adhered and fixed.

37. (Four Times Amended) A printing method comprising:

providing a substrate according to claim 1 or claim 42 or produced according to claim 30 or claim 45; and

printing a toner image on the substrate.

UDS A06

42. (Amended) A substrate suitable for printing a toner image thereon, comprising:

a sheet of plastic;

an underlayer coating, on the sheet of plastic, comprising a first polymer material comprising a polymer chosen from the group consisting of amine terminated polyamide, [a silane coupling agent and] amino propyl triethoxy silane and reaction products of amino propyl triethoxy silane; and

an overlay coating, directly on the underlayer, comprising a second polymer material and having an outer surface to which toner can be fused and fixed.